

**MINUTES**  
**Legislative Education Study Committee**  
**Hobbs Municipal Schools Training Center**  
**2110 E. Sanger Street**  
**Hobbs, New Mexico**  
**June 23 – 25, 2021**

June 23, 2021

The following voting and advisory committee members were present: Voting: Chair William P. Soules, Vice Chair G. Andrés Romero, Representatives Alonzo Baldonado, T. Ryan Lane, Derrick J. Lente, and Christine Trujillo and Senators Gay Kernan and Harold Pope, Jr. Advisory: Representatives Kelly K. Fajardo, Joanne J. Ferrary, Joy Garratt, Rebecca Dow, Tara L. Lujan, Willie D. Madrid, Debra M. Sariñana, and Elizabeth “Liz” Thomson and Senators David M. Gallegos, Craig Brandt, Linda M. Lopez, and Shannon D. Pinto.

**Call to Order and Introductions.** Chair Soules called the meeting to order.

On a motion by Representative Trujillo and a second by Representative Romero the June agenda and May minutes were approved.

**Strategic Initiatives of Local School Districts.** Gene Strickland, associate superintendent, Hobbs Municipal Schools (HMS) acknowledged outgoing superintendent TJ Parks and recognized his 40-year career. HMS has facilities that were constructed an average of 80 years ago after excluding newer construction, which drops the average age of the facilities to 57 years old. Mr. Strickland noted HMS is using the ZEROEYES gun detection system throughout the school district.

HMS is unsure how many students who left during virtual instruction will return. HMS is working to remove the stigma of summer school to address learning loss. Technology was not collected at the end of the school year; students may continue to use it during the summer. HMS is working to have counselors, social workers, and nurses at each of its campuses. Complying with Attendance for Success Act was difficult during virtual instruction. Lessons HMS learned from Covid: students are flexible, they can adapt to challenges, teachers will retool curriculum to meet student needs, parents want to be engaged, and face to face instruction is crucial.

Gerry Washburn, superintendent, Carlsbad Municipal Schools (CMS), noted the free and reduced-fee lunch numbers are not reflective of reality due to the increased cost of living in the school district. With 55 teaching vacancies, CMS is experiencing a staffing crisis. The state needs to get creative to address this crisis and Mr. Washburn suggested a five-year return to work moratorium. Current CMS initiatives include: becoming a trauma informed school district, redesigning high school and modernizing middle school for career technical education, and addressing learning loss. Students became caregivers as well as students during remote learning. Many students have not been seen since March 2020 and are resistant to coming back to campuses. To improve, New Mexico needs consistent, long-term formative assessments.

Dwain Haynes, superintendent, Eunice Municipal Schools (EMS), noted Eunice competes with New Mexico and West Texas school districts for teachers. Eunice provides housing to teachers at \$400 per month for five years to improve recruitment and retention. EMS needs counselors, social workers, nurses, and speech pathologists. The citizens of EMS tax themselves to complete capital projects and most of their projects are not eligible for matching state funding. In a typical year, each bus is driven over 30 thousand miles, and there is a shortage of bus drivers. Local control is of the utmost importance to EMS. EMS will not participate in extended learning time programs – staff are tired. Virtual education is not working for EMS students, and in person instruction is needed. Students bounced back once in person instruction resumed.

Leanne Gandy, superintendent, Lovington Municipal Schools (LMS), noted many students left LMS to attend in-person schools in Texas and for access to athletics, while other students left to be home schooled. LMS is also suffering from the teacher shortage. Of LMS's 240 teachers, 68 are eligible to retire and 60 are level 1 teachers. LMS supports the grow your own teacher program, however, non-native English speaking teachers struggle to pass the licensure exams. Ms. Gandy requested the portfolio licensure pathway be reinstated.

Ms. Gandy noted there must be stronger partnerships between higher education and public schools. Teacher preparation in math is not where it needs to be. The state needs to invest in math training as it has invested in reading training. Ms. Gandy suggested the state implement a statewide elementary math endorsement.

Representative Thomson asked how the ZEROEYES system works. Mr. Strickland responded it uses the cameras already in place throughout the school district. Detection software scans for weapons. When a possible weapon is detected, a ZEROEYES employee scans the video and proceeds appropriately.

Representative Dow asked the superintendents what they need to be successful. Ms. Gandy and Mr. Washburn responded flexibility and local control are needed. Mr. Strickland noted teachers must be reestablished as trusted professionals. Mr. Haynes responded the professional evaluation systems must be reworked and made worthwhile. He also noted local control is needed.

Representative Dow asked what, if any, commonality exists in the teacher turnover rate. Mr. Haynes responded there is a lack of amenities available in Eunice. Mr. Strickland noted housing in Hobbs is expensive. Mr. Washburn shared housing in Carlsbad is expensive, it is difficult to build connections with the community, and teachers do not feel respected. Ms. Gandy noted housing is expensive and with the boom and bust nature of the oil field, teachers are either hired away to work in the industry or they leave the school district during bust times.

Vice Chair Romero asked about enrollment growth planning at each school district for the upcoming school year. Carlsbad, Eunice, and Lovington did not budget for any projected growth while Hobbs budgeted for some growth.

**What Students Want From the New Mexico Public Education System.** Student representatives from local high schools - Abigayle Slater, Emily Hervol, Kierra Gallegos,

and Sara Rados – presented on topics ranging from teacher qualities to social and emotional wellbeing to graduation requirements. Chair Soules led the panel, asking students questions directly prior to opening up the floor for committee questions and discussion. In response to questions about teacher qualities, students noted their strongest teachers were excited to be with students every day and knew their content deeply to make lessons engaging while their weakest teachers were not responsive to student wellbeing and did not appear to enjoy teaching. Chair Soules then asked students to share their perspectives on graduation requirements. Students noted the least beneficial classes were subjects not related to current needs, like typing courses, or were not beneficial because of an ineffective teacher. In response to a question about what they believe should be fixed in New Mexico’s schools, students offered a variety of perspectives. Ms. Hervol noted the importance of clarifying the purpose of every class required in high school and linking that purpose to students’ futures. Ms. Gallegos discussed the importance of creating a positive school environment, emphasizing social and emotional learning and the mental health needs of students. Ms. Slater noted the importance of in-person learning. Ms. Rados stated student curriculum should not just be aligned to standardized tests but should provide deeper learning opportunities so students understand the purpose of learning beyond a test. All students said classes that provide learning on different life skills, like financial literacy, would be helpful. When provided the opportunity to share her perspective on the student experience as a whole, Ms. Rados noted the importance of offering a variety of extra-curricular activities to students and encouraged the Legislature to re-examine teacher licensure requirements to ensure teacher candidates are not hindered by a complicated system.

Representative Fajardo asked if any students were offered but chose not take a financial literacy course. In response, two students noted uncertainty if courses were offered at all. Ms. Rados stated financial literacy is provided through after school programs but not through a course, while Ms. Hervol stated her school offered a financial literacy course as a math credit, but students who are interested in advanced placement math courses usually take those instead of financial literacy. In response to a time management question posed by Senator Gallegos, students stated time management is primarily a self-taught skill, especially for athletes, and a course on time management would be beneficial and could reduce student stress. Representative Lujan asked about the most important lesson the pandemic taught the students. Ms. Gallegos said learning through the pandemic taught her to push through really difficult situations. Ms. Slater discussed learning she is not alone, learning change is hard but relying on people you trust can help you get through it, and the importance of her support system at home. Ms. Rados stated she had a different Covid-19 experience, as she was able to attend school in-person through her early college program. In response to a question about student mobility resulting from Covid-19 school closures, Ms. Slater noted many of her friends enrolled in school in Texas and were able to access in-person learning which improved their grades. Ms. Hervol stated she knew students who took on jobs to support their family because of online school.

In response to a question from Representative Garratt about high school scheduling, students noted it is easier to stay focused during shorter classes and 90-minute classes are too long. In response to Representative Lane’s question about what being successful high school graduate means, Ms. Rados noted she believes a successful high school graduate is a student who is prepared for college and is clear on what they want to pursue

after high school. Ms. Slater added that a successful high school graduate means a student who was given the opportunity to prepare themselves for college and the real world through college-and-career-focused high school courses. Vice Chair Romero asked what makes a positive school environment. Students discussed activities outside of academics including sports and clubs, positive interactions with school staff, and a focus on student belonging as characteristics that create a positive school environment.

**Reducing Administrative Burden of School District and Charter School Reporting Requirements.** Joseph Simon, principal analyst, LESC, provided the committee with a list of reporting requirements within the Public School Code that fell into three categories: compliance reports designed to ensure a particular law is being followed; financial transparency reports designed to ensure the prudent expenditure of taxpayer dollars; and program performance reports designed to determine if current laws and policy are effective in meeting student needs. He noted the 121 separate requirements currently in law were only one part of the picture: PED could add other requirements and federal law requires PED to receive information as a condition of receiving federal funds.

John Sena, policy director, Public Education Department (PED), provided an overview of PED's efforts to limit the administrative burdens of required reporting. In addition to statutory reports, he noted the annual budget bill contains reporting requirements. PED is streamlining the submission of annual educational plans, a required report that includes a great deal of information on a school district's and charter school's budget and educational programs. The department would look to condense and simplify reports and the new real-time data system would ensure more timely and accurate submission of data. He said PED looked forward to working with the committee to identify reports that are valuable for decision makers and bringing forward reports to eliminate.

Dennis Roch, superintendent, Logan Municipal Schools, noted that in 2016, the Martin Consulting Group was commissioned to review the public education reporting system and make recommendations for improvements. He noted the report estimated school district and charter school personnel spend 15 thousand staff hours annually completing required reporting, which diverts resources away from the classroom and into school district administration. He identified three kinds of burdensome reports: redundant reports, which require school districts and charter school to provide information already submitted; reports where data is not utilized; and reports that require many staff hours to complete but provide limited value to decision makers. Danny Parker, assistant superintendent of secondary education, Artesia Public Schools, provided additional information on specific reporting requirements that are administratively burdensome.

Chair Soules said LESC would work with PED and stakeholders through the interim to identify reports that could be eliminated. In addition, he noted the importance of legislators hearing this presentation so that new legislation considers the reporting burdens prior to enactment. Mr. Roch said the Legislature may wish to consider if new reporting requirements should include a "sunset" provision, which would automatically repeal the requirement after a set number of years. For the report to continue, the Legislature would need to reenact that portion of the law.

Representative Lane asked which reports carry the most value for decision makers and which reports carry the least value and could be eliminated. Mr. Roch replied graduation

and drop out reports reveal when the school system is failing. He said better analysis of graduation and drop out reports could help decision makers get to why students are not completing high school. Mr. Parker noted STARS, the state's student information data reporting system, could be improved to provide more useful information to decision makers. Mr. Parker noted the biggest way to alleviate administrative burdens is to eliminate redundant reporting requirements. Representative Lujan noted the importance of much of the data collected for research and Mr. Roch agreed that useful data should continue to be collected but should be reported to PED only once. Mr. Sena said individual situations could change the data that is most useful to review, citing the example of the Attendance for Success Act, which is designed to require reporting after a school reaches a certain level of student absenteeism.

Senator Brandt noted the impact of legislation on mandatory reporting, stating several bills from the past legislative session included new reporting requirements. He said legislators needed to consider the administrative burden of reporting when considering legislation. He also noted many of the issues with reporting requirements appear to be related to information technology issues and suggested the state reach out to companies experienced in data collection to improve PED's systems.

In response to Representative Thomson, Mr. Sena said some of PED's data systems are difficult to navigate and some PED staff find it easier to get information from school districts rather than pull information from STARS. Mr. Sena also noted PED's real-time data project should improve the systems. He said currently STARS does not communicate with school districts' and charter schools' student information systems and the real-time data system would improve this.

**Public School Transportation Formula.** Tim Bedeaux, policy analyst, LESC, explained the transportation formula, comparing and contrasting the differences between funding for large and small school districts and charter schools. Mr. Bedeaux reviewed how school bus replacements are funded, pointing out the differences that occur based upon whether a school district or private contractor owns the busses.

John Sena, policy director, PED, stated PED is unsure how well the public school transportation formula works. The standard of service for students is not defined: what space and capacity standards should be met, how much time should the student be on the bus, what is the availability of buses, and what is the replacement cycle for buses. PED has asked for funding for an updated transportation formula study.

Michael Baker, chief operations officer, Rio Rancho Public Schools (RRPS), said RRPS runs its own buses. Student ridership is approximately 7,900. The drivers are employed by RRPS and receive full benefits. Mr. Baker said annually, approximately \$830 thousand in operational funding is transferred to support transportation. In 2017, \$1.7 million in operational funding was used for transportation. The transportation formula does not work for RRPS.

Bonnie Lightfoot, superintendent, House Municipal Schools, said there is a difference between small and micro school districts. The transportation formula works well according to the micro school districts she polled.

Representative Ferrary asked if school bus replacement includes air conditioners on the buses. Mr. Sena responded PED is including air conditioners in the cost of buses.

In response to Senator Kernan, Mr. Sena stated 58 percent of buses are school district owned. Senator Kernan asked for additional information on how school district owned buses are funded. Mr. Bedeaux noted school district owned replacement buses are funded via a direct appropriation in the capital outlay bill contingent on available funding while the transportation funding formula is used to fund the rental fees of contractor owned buses annually.

Senator Brandt noted it is the state's responsibility to fund transportation, not the school districts' responsibility. There are school districts which are underfunded, overfunded, and appropriately funded school districts. It appears something is broken with how large school districts are funded. PED needs to bring a recommendation to the Legislature for appropriate funding for all districts.

**Approval of Appropriated 1.5 Percent Salary Increase.** The committee discussed the implementation of the legislatively approved across the board 1.5 percent salary increase and to who the increase applies. Senator Soules noted this was an across the board increase, not a performance increase. On a motion by Representative Lane and a second by Representative Baldonado moved approval of the 1.5 percent increase. On a 5-2 roll call vote the motion was approved, with Representatives Trujillo and Romero voting no.

#### June 24, 2021

The following voting and advisory committee members were present: Voting: Chair William P. Soules, Vice Chair G. Andrés Romero, Representatives Alonzo Baldonado, T. Ryan Lane, Christine Trujillo and Senators Gay Kernan and Harold Pope, Jr. Advisory: Representatives Kelly K. Fajardo, Joanne J. Ferrary, Joy Garratt, Rebecca Dow, Tara L. Lujan, Willie D. Madrid, Debra M. Sariñana, Elizabeth "Liz" Thomson and Senators David M. Gallegos, Craig Brandt, Linda M. Lopez, and Michael Padilla.

**Urenco National Enrichment Facility Tour.** Urenco staff led committee members and staff on a tour of the Urenco facility.

**Setting Expectations: Preparing Students for College and Career.** Michelle Exstrom, education program director at the National Conference of State Legislatures (NCSL), discussed global efforts to prepare students for college and career. Ms. Exstrom said students in the United States are falling behind peers internationally. According to the 2018 Programme of International Student Assessment (PISA), an exam used by 79 nations to measure the ability of 15-year-olds to apply knowledge in reading, mathematics, and science, there are eight countries performing at a higher level than the United States in reading, 30 countries performing higher in mathematics, and 11 countries performing higher in science. Students from consistently high-performing countries are about one year ahead of U.S. students. PISA results also show only 14 percent of U.S. students can distinguish between fact and opinion and 9 percent are able to apply scientific knowledge to unfamiliar situations. Ms. Exstrom added the 2019 National Assessment of Educational Progress (NAEP) – a U.S.-centered assessment of students – shows similar

findings. NAEP results show student performance is stagnant and has not improved in decades.

Ms. Exstrom also shared research from the National Center on Education and the Economy (NCEE), noting high-performing education systems include: 1) Coherent and aligned governance; 2) Effective teachers and principals; 3) Equitable foundations of support; and 4) Rigorous and adaptive learning systems. Nationally, 37 states have definitions of college and career readiness, with 21 states listing specific qualities or attributes expected of students. New Mexico does not define college and career readiness at a statewide level.

Jessica Hathaway, senior policy analyst I, LESC, shared analysis about the role of graduation requirements to support college and career readiness. Ms. Hathaway noted students in today's rapidly changing economy need guidance, strong academic experiences, and practical learning opportunities. Ms. Hathaway shared research from a 2018 audit of graduation requirements by the Center for American Progress (CAP) which found most high school graduation requirements trap students in a "preparation gap" where they do not qualify for admission to public universities and are also inadequately prepared for other jobs or post-secondary prospects. Research from CAP recommends a 15-credit course of study for all students that includes high level math and science. Ms. Hathaway shared these 15 credits compared with New Mexico's graduation requirements. Ms. Hathaway said research show rigorous curriculum alongside access to modern career technical education (CTE) courses can benefit students. CTE is offered widely across the United States and in New Mexico, but it is not as rigorous as international models. During the 2019-2020 school year, 65 thousand secondary and 50 thousand postsecondary students in New Mexico took CTE courses. Ms. Hathaway noted New Mexico anticipates \$9.7 million in federal Perkins funding and received a \$3.5 million appropriation for FY21 to support the state's Next Gen CTE Pilot Project.

Zeke Kaney, director of career and technical education, Hobbs Municipal Schools (HMS), discussed how HMS is working to support college and career readiness of students. In 2020, Hobbs High School had a graduation rate of 88 percent compared with the statewide graduation rate of 77 percent. Mr. Kaney said HMS requires 26 credits for graduation, compared with 24 units required by state statute. Despite high graduation rates in HMS, proficiency rates are similar to state averages. Nearly 60 percent of HMS graduates go to college with many starting at New Mexico Junior College (NMJC). Mr. Kaney shared in deciding whether to open a CTE center in Hobbs, HMS surveyed families in 2018 and found families felt buildings were overcrowded and many saw a need for more vocational training. This helped to inform the building of the CTE center (CTECH). HMS chose six pathways for CTECH: energy, manufacturing, culinary and hospitality, transportation, IT, and construction. HMS anticipates future challenges at CTECH related to staffing, funding of equipment and consumable materials, and academic credits.

Representative Trujillo asked how apprenticeships will be provided for students and if opportunities at CTECH will be open to alternative school students. Mr. Kaney replied

CTECH is open to all HMS students and many private sector businesses are interested in offering apprenticeships.

Senator Padilla noted the importance of soft skills and asked how students will be prepared to interview. Mr. Kaney replied HMS uses a workforce liaison to provide specific counseling on this type of skill development.

Representative Lane noted a third pathway for students outside of CTE and college could be entrepreneurship. Representative Lane said it is a distinct pathway and requires different skills. Ms. Exstrom shared information about a nonprofit called Right to Start, which focuses on students starting businesses.

Senator Gallegos echoed the importance of entrepreneurship and asked if HMS would offer evening courses or availability to the broader community. Mr. Kaney replied HMS is looking to allow CTECH to benefit the broader community.

Representative Ferrary asked if there had been a workgroup from New Mexico to analyze education efforts in the state compared with frameworks such as that from NCEE. Ms. Exstrom replied New Mexico has several assets and interest in this topic, but there has been no formal workgroup. Ms. Exstrom added that in many other countries, NCSL found high-performing systems were formed out of large global events related to crisis and revolution, offering the opportunity for these countries to completely rethink their education systems. Ms. Exstrom commented that the United States has had the most advanced education system for nearly 100 years, meaning the United States is tasked with reform rather than completely designing from the ground up. Ms. Exstrom cited Massachusetts and New Jersey as states with highly functional systems.

Representative Thomson asked how CTE might look in small, rural communities where there may not be much industry. Ms. Exstrom cited a partnership in rural Colorado where a school partnered with a third party named Career Wise. Ms. Exstrom noted rural communities can look to partner to bring more business interest, often coalescing around unique needs in each place.

Representative Romero commented on the role of teachers in soft skill development, adding the perspective that it may be partly on teachers to educate all students not just on subject matter, but also soft skills.

Chair Soules asked how to get business and industry interested in partnering with education. Ms. Exstrom said because of policies and practices, it can be challenging to form strong relationships. Ms. Exstrom cited an example in Indiana where a third party entity was used to facilitate negotiations between school districts and businesses. Chair Soules also asked about barriers for setting up CTE and advanced manufacturing in high schools. Ms. Exstrom noted barriers such as equipment, teaching staff, internship and elective credit availability, and determining academic credit are consistent across the country. Chair Soules asked how Hobbs plans to scale its CTE offerings. Mr. Kaney noted HMS anticipates hurdles, but plans to have advisors at CTECH doing slightly different work than typical school counselors. Advisors will be managing internships and offering work-related support.

**Workforce Needs in Southeast New Mexico.** Molly Young, director of education and workforce strategic initiatives, Permian Strategic Partnership (PSP) provided an overview of PSP and its mission. Two of PSP's focus areas are education and workforce. Ms. Young said PSP invests in efforts from early childhood to career and life. Ms. Young also shared information about specific PSP efforts such as the Education Leadership Summit and their Catalyst program. At the Education Leadership Summit, PSP convened education leaders to discuss strategies for spending federal Covid-19 stimulus funds in effective ways. In its Catalyst program, PSP is working to define industry-benchmarked skills and competencies required by jobs in the Permian Basin and then partnering with education training providers to address gaps in skills needed and education offered. PSP is also an investor in the Career and Technical Education Center (CTECH) being built by Hobbs Municipal Schools.

Beth Elias, programs manager for the New Mexico Eastern Area Workforce Development Board, discussed workforce needs and economic recovery in Lea, Chaves, and Eddy counties. Ms. Elias noted the largest employment sectors in all three counties are mining, quarrying, and oil and gas extraction, which jointly employ about 13.5 thousand workers. The next largest sectors are retail trade (employing roughly 9,500 workers) and health care and social assistance (employing roughly 9,000 workers). Ms. Elias said the population across Lea, Chaves, and Eddy counties was about 193 thousand, the region has a civilian labor force of nearly 87 thousand, and a median household income of about \$56 thousand annually. Ms. Elias added jobs requiring a two-year degree or certificate are expected to grow most rapidly in the region (1 percent annual growth) over the next decade. Jobs requiring a bachelor's degree or a postgraduate degree are both expected to grow at 0.7 percent annually over the next decade.

Ms. Elias commented on how the Covid-19 pandemic has affected the workforce and noted at the end of 2019, oil prices were already dropping, resulting in fewer jobs in the oil and gas industry. The pandemic worsened the situation. Before declines in oil and gas prices, the sector was projected to see continued growth of 300 percent through 2029. As oil and gas jobs are impacted in the southeast region, it reduces jobs in construction, hospitality and leisure, retail and transportation, and material moving industries. Ms. Elias also addressed a need for soft skills consistently requested by employers. Top soft skills requested include communication, customer service, self-motivation, teamwork, and being adaptable.

Ms. Elias said three-year projections indicate a potential for shortages in the healthcare and business sectors and an excess in food preparation, sales, and administrative support sectors. Ms. Elias also discussed how current reporting of workforce data does not always reflect the realistic job market. Students today may need to be prepared for jobs that do not yet exist.

Tres Hicks, chair of the Economic Development Corporation (EDC) of Lea County, noted the average unemployment rate in Lea County was 4.1 percent in 2019. In 2020, the unemployment rate was reported at 11 percent overall, but Mr. Hicks speculated it was likely closer to 15 percent at the height of the pandemic. So far in 2021, the unemployment rate has dropped from 13.8 percent to 10.1 percent in Lea County. Mr. Hicks said business

is recovering, but finding labor continues to be a challenge. Mr. Hicks noted the labor force in Lea County has dropped by about 2,500 workers between 2019 and 2021. Mr. Hicks closed with observations that as an employer, he sees apprenticeships, experiential learning, reading skills, and making learning relevant to students as paramount to student success.

Chair Soules asked how much of the labor force in the southeast region is transient, following oil and gas around the country. Mr. Hicks estimated somewhere between 50 and 60 percent of the labor force during the oil and gas boom was transient.

**Hobbs Career and Technical Education Center Partnership.** TJ Parks, superintendent of Hobbs Municipal Schools (HMS), Sam Cobb, mayor of the City of Hobbs, Mayra Lovas, senior program officer at the JF Maddox Foundation, and Tracee Bentley, president and chief executive officer of the Permian Strategic Partnership (PSP), participated in a roundtable discussion about the development of the Career Technical Education Center (CTECH) being built by HMS in Hobbs. Panelists were interviewed by Jessica Hathaway, senior policy analyst I, LESC.

Mr. Parks explained the partnership was initially formed as a result of a proven model of coalition building they have used in other projects in the Hobbs community. Mr. Cobb noted previous partnerships between the city and school district helped set the stage for additional investments like CTECH. In discussing how CTECH was envisioned, Mr. Parks noted the school district looked at models of CTE schools nationwide to decide what to build in Hobbs.

As panelists discussed their vision for CTECH, Ms. Lovas said the JF Maddox Foundation was already offering scholarships and supporting education, but views CTECH as a way to innovate the workforce in Lea County. Ms. Bentley added as a funder, they were especially inspired by the strong leadership and collaboration they saw between Mr. Parks and Mr. Cobb. PSP views CTECH as a benefit to Hobbs and Lea County, but also as a potential key hub for the Permian Basin.

Panelists were asked about long-term hopes for CTECH. Mayor Cobb shared his view that access to vocational education is crucial. He hopes CTECH can be used for diversification of industry in the region. Mr. Cobb also noted capital partners in the project – the City of Hobbs, PSP, the JF Maddox Foundation, and the Daniels Fund – also built sustainability into grant agreements so they can continue to share needs from economic development and inform curriculum at CTECH. Mr. Parks said for every \$1 invested in CTE, there is a \$9 gain. Ms. Bentley said PSP desires children in the Permian Basin to have a strong education. If someone is born and raised in the Permian Basin, they are much more likely to stay. PSP views CTECH as an important tool for the region to “grow their own” workforce. Mr. Parks noted Hobbs held a bond election to help fund the facility, which passed with an 82 percent approval rate. Ms. Lovas added a hope to see more choice and opportunity in Lea County communities. The foundation also hopes children see Lea County as a place to build their lives instead of leaving to find job opportunities.

Panelists were asked what their one piece of advice for legislators would be. Mr. Cobb said collaboration has to be present and it is important to acknowledge CTE is more expensive than the traditional education system. Mr. Parks added the view that flexibility of curriculum is important. He cited an example of allowing a math credit to count when schools can see a crosswalk in relevant content, such as in construction math. Ms. Bentley echoed the importance of flexibility. As CTECH looks to fill instructor and teachers, lawmakers should know schools are not looking for traditional classroom teachers and instead, need skilled trade workers that can also instruct. Ms. Bentley said it is important to build alignment across broader regions when CTE centers are being built to avoid competition for resources. Ms. Lovas agreed about the importance of sharing of resources and having trusted partners.

Representative Lane asked what the first two steps should be to implement a project like this in Farmington. Mr. Cobb replied fortifying the underlying collaboration between schools and the community would be the first item to work on and the second would be to find people to build a vision with. Mr. Parks said consistency is important, adding in New Mexico, the average tenure of superintendents is just under three years. With short tenure, it can be a challenge to build consistency. Representative Lane asked how to avoid duplicating efforts that may be similar such as those at a community college. Mr. Parks noted a much stronger system can be built if all entities unify efforts. At HMS, they engaged the New Mexico Junior College (NMJC) frequently to inventory current CTE efforts and ensure they were not duplicating. Mr. Parks also noted they built bridges between the high school and community college so when students leave the CTECH program, they can continue at NMJC if appropriate.

Senator Gallegos commented on the progress of the project and asked if CTECH could be used as a business incubator, especially in a potentially changing economy. Mr. Parks replied a culture of innovation and flexibility matters and oil companies are innovating every day. Mr. Cobb noted many CTE centers they visited featured students making presentations to venture capitalists to take ideas to market. HMS and the city envision CTECH students having access to the business community. Ms. Lovas added NMJC has a small business accelerator and is a strong resource in the Hobbs community. Ms. Bentley offered a perspective from the oil and gas industry, noting they view their business far beyond extraction and as part of the broader energy market. Many PSP companies have significant portfolios in wind, solar, and hydroelectricity.

Representative Lujan commented on the innovation of the project and asked what panelists would like to see from legislators. Mr. Parks replied sustainability of funding for any CTE program is important. As vocational education is revitalized, the current funding formula may need to be reconsidered as it is unclear if the current 1.25 multiplier is enough. Mr. Parks said schools have to pay CTE instructors more than other educators. If CTE is desired, the Legislature will need to address funding, recognizing CTE is more expensive. Representative Lujan asked how partnerships could be created in parts of New Mexico that may have different resources and funding mechanisms than Lea County. Mr. Parks replied the education community cannot be afraid to go knock on doors. Ms. Bentley also noted funding streams can be created with any economic drivers in a local

economy. Ms. Lovas recommended finding a trustworthy funder and getting community buy-in via the funder. She added funders can help make connections.

Chair Soules asked what the marginal difference in the cost of offering CTE is and what recommendation the panel would have about a funding formula multiplier to fund CTE. Mr. Parks said a study would be needed to determine a specific multiplier. Mr. Parks also noted the state education funding formula has been changed over 80 times and because of the cascading impacts each time it is manipulated, it would be difficult to determine the exact multiplier needed. Chair Soules also asked about the added cost of offering CTE compared with traditional classroom instruction. Mr. Parks noted HMS planned for \$1.2 million in additional costs related to opening CTECH. Senator Kernan added the higher education funding formula in New Mexico may be informative as it uses a tiered system to fund higher cost programs.

**Tour of Career and Technical Education Center (Construction Site).** The tour was cancelled for safety reasons due to severe lightning storms in the immediate area.

#### June 25, 2021

The following voting and advisory committee members were present: Voting: Chair William P. Soules, Vice Chair G. Andrés Romero, Representatives Alonzo Baldonado, T. Ryan Lane, and Christine Trujillo and Senators Gay Kernan and Harold Pope, Jr. Advisory: Representatives Joanne J. Ferrary, Joy Garratt, Tara L. Lujan, Willie D. Madrid, Debra M. Sariñana, and Elizabeth “Liz” Thomson and Senators David M. Gallegos, Craig Brandt, and Linda M. Lopez.

**Tour of the Center of Recreational Excellence.** Lyndsey Henderson, facility director, CORE, led committee members and the audience on a tour of the CORE facility.

**Teacher Workforce Tracking.** Michelle Exstrom, education program director, National Conference of State Legislatures, discussed why educator workforce tracking is important, how other states approach this work, and what is being done in high-performing international education systems. Ms. Exstrom shared the first and second factors that have the most impact on student outcomes are teachers and principals. Ms. Exstrom said it is important to know how many teachers you need to prepare and in what subject areas. She also shared thinking about equity is important and ensuring all students have access to high quality teachers. Often, teacher shortages are seen in schools where the students need them the most. States have made progress around teacher tracking, but local and national focus is currently on how data is not being utilized to its full potential, is misused, and has gaps, among other concerns. Ms. Exstrom said 10 to 15 years ago many states were not collecting workforce data. Since then, many states have made progress in this area like Colorado, Missouri, and Arkansas. Legislative action has pushed Colorado to provide a strategic plan to address teacher shortages, survey school districts to understand supply and demand, and use data to inform legislative policy. Other state legislators are also thinking of how to enact policies to diversify the teacher workforce. This work is really important, but there needs to be targeted policies in this area and data can help inform these decisions. The Wallace Foundation has been focusing efforts on building principal pipelines and a key element of this work is strong university and

school district partnerships. Ms. Exstrom NCSL's *No Time to Lose* work highlighted that countries with high-performing systems have highly effective instruction. These countries are very intentional about the rigor and the number of teachers they need to prepare. They have a thorough understanding of where the shortages are and ensure that the number of teacher candidates is matched with the need, so they do not under or over produce educators. In most cases, this is possible because they have fewer educator preparation programs.

Emily Hoxie, senior policy analyst I, LESC, said research tells us that when imbalances in teacher workforces occur, school districts may adopt strategies that create suboptimal learning environments for students. This could include short-term solutions like filling a classroom with long term substitutes or overfilling classrooms. Well-trained staff are essential to ensure all students have access to high-quality education, which creates urgency around the importance of educator workforce training. Chelsea Canada, senior policy analyst II, LESC, shared the New Mexico context and what current tracking and reporting efforts are happening in this area. New Mexico currently has two reports focused on teacher supply and demand and teacher preparation quality. The Educator Accountability Report is currently required by statute and the purpose of the report has morphed over time. Ms. Canada shared PED currently uses the report in its state accreditation process and the most recent report was published in December 2020 for the 2017-2018 school year. In 2015, after a lapse in state reporting, New Mexico State University started to publish a report to illustrate the magnitude of the teacher shortage. In addition to these reports, educator preparation programs are also required to report additional data to PED, the federal government, and a national accrediting body if their program is nationally accredited. Ms. Canada recommended the Legislature update who is reporting data in this area and what data should be collected on the teacher workforce to inform educator stakeholder decision making around recruitment, preparation, and retention. Ms. Hoxie said to do this, data needs have to be identified and the Legislature must work with education stakeholders to accomplish this work.

Gwen Perea Warniment, Ph.D., deputy secretary of teaching, Public Education Department, reviewed PED's perspective on how the current Educator Accountability Report is interpreted, how it can be improved, and a proposed theory of action on what educator preparation programs need to be reporting on in this space.

Ms. Perea Warniment said inputs and outputs and an agreed upon set of data that is tied to a theory of action are needed for an accountability system to work. The current report is not timely and does not allow stakeholders to act in real time. The data that is collected is not situated in a way to look at things in a system and should be used for a cycle of improvement. A proposed theory of action around educator preparation programs should inform the data that is collected; data could align with best practices and research around educator preparation such as measures focused on deeper learning, long term clinical placements, meaningful partnerships with school districts and charter schools, and culturally based learning. Ms. Perea Warniment said meaningful partnerships with state agencies, the Legislature, and education stakeholders are needed for this work to be implemented. She also suggested a real-time data system is needed and a fully staffed PED bureau that oversees this work. Ms. Perea Warniment concluded that PED is doing work in the educator workforce space by preparing to launch an "educator ecosystem taskforce," and looks forward to continued partnership in this area.

Representative Garratt said New Mexico needs to also track principal preparation, hiring, and retention. Senator Brandt suggested the Higher Education Department needs to be involved in these discussions and classroom management needs to be weaved through the entirety of preparation. Senator Lopez shared it is necessary to hear from educator program faculty then they are generally prohibited from interacting with the Legislature.

Representative Romero said LESC tried to have oversight over higher education and this strategy would help the committee on work in the teacher preparation space, but the bill was vetoed by the governor. In response to a question by Representative Romero, Ms. Perea Warniment said the department does not collect data from dossiers that are submitted by teachers as they advance through the three-tiered licensure system. Representative Romero said he is hopeful the teacher evaluation will identify outcomes from different teachers with different experiences, such as national board certification and attainment of a master's degree.

Ms. Exstrom said teacher preparation typically has the least amount of state legislative action; states usually do not like to use their policy levers around approving programs and shutting programs down.

Senator Soules asked Ms. Perea Warniment if colleges and universities in the state understood the impact of the *Martinez and Yazzie* consolidated lawsuit on educator preparation programs. Ms. Perea Warniment said leaders of educator preparation programs are aware of the lawsuit, but many do not understand the implications for their programs. Ms. Perea Warniment also shared an idea to better connect educator preparation programs and actual school settings by requiring college faculty to have an active K-12 teaching license.

**June Meeting Reflection.** Members were lead through self-reflection exercises by staff. The meeting adjourned at 11:45 a.m.