

STATE OF NEW MEXICO
LEGISLATIVE EDUCATION STUDY COMMITTEE

REPRESENTATIVES

Dennis J. Roch, Chair
Nora Espinoza
Tomás E. Salazar
Sheryl M. Williams Stapleton
Christine Trujillo
Monica Youngblood

ADVISORY

Alonzo Baldonado
Jim Dines
David M. Gallegos
Stephanie Garcia Richard
Jimmie C. Hall
D. Wonda Johnson
Timothy D. Lewis
G. Andrés Romero
Patricia Roybal Caballero
James E. Smith
James G. Townsend

State Capitol North, 325 Don Gaspar, Suite 200
Santa Fe, New Mexico 87501
Phone: (505) 986-4591 Fax: (505) 986-4338
<http://www.nmlegis.gov/lcs/lesc/lescdefault.aspx>



SENATORS

John M. Sapien, Vice Chair
Craig W. Brandt
Gay G. Kernan
Howie C. Morales

ADVISORY

Jacob R. Candelaria
Carlos R. Cisneros
Lee S. Cotter
Daniel A. Ivey-Soto
Linda M. Lopez
Michael Padilla
John Pinto
William P. Soules
Mimi Stewart
Pat Woods

Frances Ramírez-Maestas, Director
Ian M. Kleats, Deputy Director

MINUTES
LESC MEETING
October 28-30, 2015

Representative Dennis J. Roch, Chair, called the meeting of the Legislative Education Study Committee (LESC) to order at 8:45 a.m., on Wednesday, October 28, 2015, in Room 307 of the State Capitol in Santa Fe, New Mexico.

The following voting members of the LESC were present:

Representatives Dennis J. Roch, Chair, Nora Espinoza, Tomás E. Salazar, Sheryl M. Williams Stapleton, Christine Trujillo, and Monica Youngblood; and Senators John M. Sapien, Vice Chair, Craig W. Brandt, Gay G. Kernan, and Howie C. Morales.

The following advisory members of the LESC were present:

Representatives Alonzo Baldonado, G. Andrés Romero, and Patricia Roybal Caballero; and Senators Jacob R. Candelaria, Lee S. Cotter, Linda M. Lopez, Michael Padilla, William P. Soules, Mimi Stewart, and Pat Woods.

The following advisory members of the LESC were not present:

Representatives Jim Dines, David M. Gallegos, Stephanie Garcia Richard, Jimmie C. Hall, D. Wonda Johnson, Timothy D. Lewis, James E. Smith, and James G. Townsend; and Senators Carlos R. Cisneros, Daniel A. Ivey-Soto, and John Pinto.

On a motion by Senator Sapien, seconded by Senator Brandt, the committee approved the October meeting agenda.

EXECUTIVE SESSION FOR MATTERS RELATING TO PERSONNEL

Before entertaining any motions, the Chair explained that the committee intended to meet in closed session for the purpose of conducting interviews with six applicants for the position of LESC staff director. To provide for uniformity in the process, he continued, each applicant would be asked the same series of questions, and the committee would discuss the merits of the applicants only after all interviews had been conducted. Any action taken to appoint an LESC staff director, he concluded, would be made in open session thereafter.

On a motion by Representative Trujillo to convene closed session for the purpose of conducting interviews for the position of LESC staff director and discussion of matters related to personnel, seconded by Senator Brandt, the Chair called the roll.

The following members voted in the affirmative:

Representatives Nora Espinoza, Dennis J. Roch, Tomás E. Salazar, Christine Trujillo, and Monica Youngblood; and Senators Craig W. Brandt, Howie C. Morales, and John M. Sapien.

The following members voted in the negative: None.

The following voting members were not present:

Representative Sheryl M. Williams Stapleton and Senator Gay G. Kernan.

By a vote of 8-0, the committee convened closed session at 8:55 a.m.

On a motion by Representative Trujillo to return to open session, seconded by Representative Espinoza, the Chair called the roll.

The following members voted in the affirmative:

Representatives Nora Espinoza, Dennis J. Roch, Tomás E. Salazar, Sheryl M. Williams Stapleton, Christine Trujillo, and Monica Youngblood; and Senators Craig W. Brandt, Gay G. Kernan, Howie C. Morales, and John M. Sapien.

The following members voted in the negative: None.

By a vote of 10-0, the committee returned to open session at 3:47 p.m. Upon returning to open session, the Chair explained that nothing was discussed except personnel matters and no actions were taken in closed session. He entertained a motion at that time.

On a motion by Senator Brandt to appoint Ms. Rachel S. Gudgel as the LESC staff director, seconded by Senator Sapien, the Chair called the roll.

The following members voted in the affirmative:

Representatives Nora Espinoza, Dennis J. Roch, and Monica Youngblood; and Senators Craig W. Brandt, Gay G. Kernan, Howie C. Morales, and John M. Sapien.

The following members voted in the negative: Representatives Tomás E. Salazar, Sheryl M. Williams Stapleton, and Christine Trujillo.

By a vote of 7-3, the committee appointed Ms. Gudgel as the LESC staff director. The Chair stated that a salary for Ms. Gudgel and the date for assuming the responsibilities of directorship would be set by the committee at a later point during the committee meeting.

As the Chair allowed members to explain their votes, a committee member, when expressing the reasons for her vote in opposition, looked for commitment from the newly appointed director that she would be responsive and provide equitable access to every LESC member.

There being no further business, the Chair with the consensus of the committee, recessed the LESC meeting at 3:52 p.m.

**MINUTES
LESC MEETING
October 29, 2015**

Representative Dennis J. Roch, Chair, called the meeting of the Legislative Education Study Committee (LESC) to order at 8:07 a.m., on Thursday, October 29, 2015, in Room 307 of the State Capitol in Santa Fe, New Mexico.

The following voting members of the LESL were present:

Representatives Dennis J. Roch, Chair, Nora Espinoza, Tomás E. Salazar, Sheryl M. Williams Stapleton, Christine Trujillo, and Monica Youngblood; and Senators John M. Sapien, Vice Chair, Craig W. Brandt, and Howie C. Morales.

The following voting member of the LESL was not present:

Senator Gay G. Kernan.

The following advisory members of the LESL were present:

Representatives Alonzo Baldonado and Stephanie Garcia Richard; and Senators Lee S. Cotter, Linda M. Lopez, Michael Padilla, John Pinto, William P. Soules, and Mimi Stewart.

The following advisory members of the LESL were not present:

Representatives Jim Dines, David M. Gallegos, Jimmie C. Hall, D. Wonda Johnson, Timothy D. Lewis, G. Andrés Romero, Patricia Roybal Caballero, James E. Smith, and James G. Townsend; and Senators Jacob R. Candelaria, Carlos R. Cisneros, Daniel A. Ivey-Soto, and Pat Woods.

UNIVERSITY OF NEW MEXICO: COLLEGE OF EDUCATION REDESIGN

The Chair recognized Dr. Salvador Hector Ochoa, Dean, College of Education (CoE), University of New Mexico (UNM), to present on the UNM CoE redesign efforts.

Dr. Ochoa provided an overview of what he would highlight, which included information on UNM CoE programs and students, the number of teachers produced by UNM, factors that informed UNM's re-imagination efforts, the four cornerstones of the re-imagination efforts to transform UNM's teacher preparation efforts, and addressing teacher shortage needs in critical areas.

Dr. Ochoa noted UNM CoE offers nine doctoral programs, 11 master's level programs, and four graduate certificate programs. While noting alignment between many master's and doctoral level programs, Dr. Ochoa highlighted the Physical Education, Sports, and Exercise Science program as one of only seven programs in the United States. He also stated the rigor of the Counselor Education program was equivalent to similar programs nationally.

Dr. Ochoa cited UNM CoE graduate student enrollment for fall 2015 of 297 doctoral students, 588 master's level students, and 70 graduate certificate students, totaling 955 students. He also noted 300 additional students were enrolled in undergraduate-level, non-Teacher Education programs, remarking that CoE programs for undergraduate-level students include educator preparation programs in the following areas: Early Childhood Multicultural Education; and Physical, Elementary, Secondary, and Special Education.

Of the 700 teacher education candidates in the UNM CoE program, Dr. Ochoa stated 73 percent are female and 27 percent are male. Additionally, 45 percent of the students identify as Caucasian. The remaining candidates identify in the following ways: 38 percent Hispanic; 10 percent American Indian or Alaska Native; 2.0 percent African-American; 2.0 percent two or more races; and less than 1.0 percent Native Hawaiian or Pacific Islander. Dr. Ochoa said UNM produces 20 percent to 25 percent of all licensed educators in the state annually.

Dr. Ochoa noted the following factors assisted UNM's re-imagination efforts: state student demographics; educator preparation priority needs; and input from external constituents. He added that: 74 percent of students in New Mexico are ethnically diverse; 17 percent of the state's students are enrolled in bilingual education; 22 percent of the students live below the poverty line; and 14 percent have an identifiable disability.

He stated it is critical for UNM to train educators to better serve the unique population of the state so educational disparities in student achievement will decrease.

Regarding educator preparation priority needs, Dr. Ochoa stated the following have driven UNM's re-imagination efforts: increasing student educational outcomes; increasing teacher retention rates; increasing the number of teachers in the science, technology, engineering, and mathematics (STEM) field; enhancing teacher preparation to serve students with disabilities and English language learners (ELLs); improvement in the areas of data management and assessment; enhancing classroom management training; and enhancing clinical experiences and student teaching.

Dr. Ochoa noted UNM's re-imagination effort focus on four key areas: curriculum, clinical practices, assessment and accountability, and research. Currently, the CoE is in the process of an overall curriculum review for its five major programs, and task forces have been established within the CoE to determine ways to increase the efforts to better serve ELLs, Native American students, and students with disabilities. This past week, faculty within the college voted to accept the curriculum changes, and Dr. Ochoa indicated the process will continue with the proposed changes being submitted to other levels of the university.

Regarding clinical practice, Dr. Ochoa emphasized a focus on placing teacher candidates in settings that are reflective of the state's demographics and where they are most likely to work when they begin their educational careers. With intense internal supervision, he hopes this will allow teacher candidates to become better prepared after graduation to improve instruction and become culturally competent. In these efforts, UNM assists school districts by employing part-time and full-time faculty in the following designated schools where the teacher candidates will be teaching, which were chosen based on the percentage of students eligible for free or reduced-fee lunch, percentage of diverse ethnicities, and reading and math proficiencies: San Felipe Pueblo Elementary School (Bureau of Indian Education) and Headstart program; Pajarito

Elementary School (Albuquerque Public Schools); and Bernalillo High School (Bernalillo Public Schools).

Dr. Ochoa mentioned another program involving interdisciplinary faculty work known as Transforming Action Groups (TAG). Each TAG involves clinical, tenure, or tenure-track faculty who supervise, mentor, advise, and teach at the previously mentioned school project sites as well as the following public schools in Albuquerque: George I. Sánchez Collaborative Community School K-8 School; Highland High School; Rio Grande High School; and Atrisco Heritage Academy High School.

With respect to the third cornerstone of UNM's re-imagination efforts that focuses on assessment and accountability, Dr. Ochoa emphasized the conceptual framework for educator preparation at UNM based on understandings, practices, and identity. He noted how the understanding of culture, language, pedagogy, and professional issues enables teacher candidates to value and engage in practices that embody the following qualities while developing a professional identity is central to lifelong growth as a professional educator: learner-centered, contextual, coherent, culturally responsive, and technologically current.

The final cornerstone of UNM re-imagination plan is research. Dr. Ochoa highlighted a CoE goal to establish an interdisciplinary research and outreach center to create collaborative research partnerships with K-12 schools to: evaluate current practices; identify and empirically validate best practices specific to New Mexico student demographics; improve educational achievement and development along a Pre-K to 20 continuum; and increase the number of college- and career-ready students.

In conclusion, Dr. Ochoa explained UNM's efforts to address current teacher shortages in the state. Referring to a high need for special education teachers, he noted 30 to 40 teacher candidates with emphasis on special education are produced by the UNM-Gallup branch college every year. UNM also developed an Accelerated Alternative Licensure Program in STEM fields to address the state's high need for STEM-certified educators. Recently, the second cohort of students began the program with the assistance of the Public Education Department (PED) stipends.

Committee Discussion

In reference to a committee member's inquiry on what is needed for educators to work more effectively with ELL students, Dr. Ochoa stated that training for the state's teachers to understand language acquisition is critical in preventing ELL students from missing opportunities. Generally, teacher candidates proceed through UNM's program with a general education degree and have to return to complete their bilingual education endorsement. He mentioned structural and procedural options to create a bilingual early education degree plan in collaboration with PED and the Higher Education Department to address this concern.

A committee member noted a decrease in the number of students going into teacher education programs. Dr. Ochoa explained UNM has formulated the following strategic approach to recruitment: work in collaboration with New Mexico State University to promote and expand the Educator Rising program; reach out to students who are getting a degree in a licensure field and suggest opportunities with the CoE to become an educator; and conduct strategic marketing in collaboration with school districts.

In reply to a committee member's question on programs focusing on early childhood educators, Dr. Ochoa stated that UNM merged the early childhood and family studies programs into one program, with three different tracks within the merged program. One track focuses on students who will work with children from birth to age 4 in a nonpublic school setting. The next track focuses on pre-kindergarten certification. The final track focuses on students intending to work in an early childhood care intervention program.

COLLEGE AFFORDABILITY AND ACCESS

The Chair recognized Dr. Barbara Damron, Cabinet Secretary, Higher Education Department (HED), to brief the committee on college affordability and access. Dr. Damron began by informing the committee of recent research from the Lumina Foundation based on national data that indicates:

- college tuition has increased by 45 percent on average over the past decade, while household income has declined by 7.0 percent in the same period; and
- based on 2011-2012 tuition costs, a bachelor's degree completed in four years would cost on average, of between \$59,400 (if transferring from a two-year institution) to \$111,600 (for private nonprofit institutions).

She reported that, from 2005 through 2008, student loans were the lowest form of household debt in the United States. However, after the onset of the Great Recession, student loans became the largest category of household debt from 2011 through 2014.

Comparing the cost of higher education in New Mexico to other western states, Dr. Damron stated:

- according to recent data from the Western Interstate Commission for Higher Education (WICHE), New Mexico's average tuition and fees were among the lowest of the western states in academic year 2014-2015; and
- New Mexico's tuition and fees were comparatively low for the western region across both two- and four-year institutions of higher education (IHEs) in academic year 2014-2015.

These findings, she said, suggest higher education in New Mexico is relatively affordable when compared to other states.

Dr. Damron also reported that from academic year 2009-2010 to academic year 2014-2015, in-state tuition and fees at public four-year IHEs increased an average of 17 percent nationwide (The College Board, Annual Survey of Colleges), and that:

- the most recent available US Census data show that over a similar time span the national median household income declined by 4.6 percent after adjusting for inflation (US Census, Historical Household Income Tables -Table H.6, accessed September 2015); and
- a growing gap between college costs and family incomes will limit the accessibility and affordability of higher education nationally and in New Mexico.

She noted the New Mexico Legislative Lottery Scholarship currently covers 90 percent of each higher education sector's average tuition for fall 2015 and spring 2016. With all other factors being equal (e.g., lottery proceeds, enrollment levels, and liquor excise taxes), tuition increases lower the percentage of tuition that the Lottery Scholarship is able to cover.

Regarding the cost of tuition and the cost of attendance, Dr. Damron stated:

- New Mexico's six-year graduation rate for four-year higher education institutions is roughly 46 percent, which is below the national average of 69 percent;
- students accumulate more tuition costs and debt when they take longer to graduate from college; and
- New Mexico students could end up with a high total cost of attendance despite relatively low tuition and fees.

Compared to national trends, Dr. Damron noted that, data from the State Higher Education Executive Officers Association show that state appropriations and tuition have historically been the two primary revenue sources for US public higher education. Additionally, state appropriations for public higher education declined from 2008 through 2014 due to the economic downturn. Consequently, public higher education revenues increasingly came from tuition.

Dr. Damron concluded higher education in New Mexico is relatively affordable compared to other states in terms of tuition and fees. She added that, as state appropriations to higher education have decreased nationally since 2008, public IHEs have become increasingly reliant on tuition revenue. In New Mexico, state General Fund support has nearly recovered to prerecession levels, but Dr. Damron noted tuition is only one factor impacting college affordability and other factors include: median income, total cost of attendance, and lottery scholarships.

Committee Discussion

In response to committee members' questions regarding students who receive the Lottery Scholarship not being prepared for college and completing remedial coursework, Dr. Damron emphasized the circular nature of the education system, highlighting the role of prenatal development and better teacher preparation in that cycle.

SCIENCE, TECHNOLOGY, ENGINEERING, AND MATH (STEM) ACTION TEAM

The Chair recognized Ms. Heather Balas, President and Executive Director, New Mexico First, to brief the committee on the findings and recommendations of the Science, Technology, Engineering, and Mathematics (STEM) Action Team, along with the following co-presenters:

- Dr. Karen Trujillo, Director, K-12 Outreach, College of Education, New Mexico State University (NMSU), and Chair-Elect, New Mexico Partnership for Math and Science Education (NMPMSE);
- Ms. Selena Connealy, Education and Outreach Coordinator, New Mexico Experimental Program to Stimulate Competitive Research; and
- Ms. TK O'Geary, Consultant and International Trainer, Northrop Grumman Corporation.

The STEM Action Team, Ms. Balas explained, is a statewide coalition of employers, teachers, professors, and nonprofit professionals seeking to improve STEM education and raise awareness among policymakers and the public; convened by the NMPMSE; and managed by New Mexico First.

In regard to the rationale for improving STEM education in New Mexico, Ms. Balas explained that in the future, experts predict that 80 percent of all jobs will require STEM skills. She noted many professionals in STEM-related industries are retiring and will have to be replaced; therefore, Ms. Balas stated that the STEM Action Team has developed the following goals to reach by 2020:

- increase by 25 percent the number of students measurably proficient in math and science;
- recruit and train 1,000 new STEM teachers while supporting and retaining existing STEM teachers; and
- increase by 25 percent the number of college graduates in STEM fields (including health).

To address the challenges for meeting these three goals, she referred the committee to several charts showing disparities in fourth and eighth grade math achievement among New Mexico students compared to US students in the same grades, as well as disparities in achievement among those students within the state by race and ethnicity. Another challenge highlighted by Ms. Balas was a lack of funding for K-12 STEM education. She noted lawmakers place a heavy emphasis on early literacy, but the situation is more complex than it looks. The STEM Action Team recommended:

- an increase in funding for the Math and Science Bureau at the Public Education Department (PED); and
- identifying opportunities to better leverage literacy dollars that can also support math or science.

Dr. Trujillo noted FY 15 and FY 16 appropriations to PED totaled \$62.3 million for literacy but only \$2.4 million was appropriated for math and science. In addition, she suggested elementary science is often overlooked until fourth grade, and K-3 Plus had been identified as a potential opportunity to incorporate science into the early grades. The team recommended using curricula like *Seeds of Science/Roots of Reading* to build more science into the K-3 Plus program.

Since summer and after-school programs have been shown to boost student achievement, the team also recommended an increase in funding for after-school and summer programs that include STEM or prioritization of existing funding toward STEM. Currently in New Mexico, Dr. Trujillo noted:

- 37 percent of after-school programs offer STEM compared to 69 percent of after-school programs nationwide;
- 80 percent of public school parents want STEM in after-school programs;
- 70,000 New Mexico students are in after-school programs; and
- 90,000 more students would enroll if they could.

Regarding new STEM teachers, she briefed the committee on the existing teacher incentives, which include the:

- Teacher Loan for Service program;
- Teacher Loan Repayment Program (TLRP); and
- STEM and Hard-to-Staff Teacher Initiative.

The STEM Action Team recommended these initiatives continue to be funded and increases to the TLRP be considered while potentially expanding eligibility for TLRP to include rural areas in addition to high-risk schools. Noting the higher education funding formula currently provides an incentive for STEM graduates but not for math- and science-certified education graduates, the STEM Action Team also recommended the Higher Education Department perform a cost study on the potential impacts of providing those additional incentives.

Ms. Connealy discussed other challenges and recommendations, including:

- the need to monitor national efforts to update teacher competencies and use that information to update regulations;
- continuing to invest in quality professional development and focusing on evidence-based programs within the state to improve retention and support for existing STEM teachers;
- keeping college graduates in STEM fields through continued or increased support for programs that support STEM students in college, including internships and student research; and
- reducing the number of students required to take remedial math by studying best practices on the implementation of alternate or multiple mathematics pathways at the institutions of higher education statewide.

To conclude, Ms. O'Geary encouraged the committee to consider private industry as a partner in expanding STEM education, and indicated private industries are investing approximately \$80 million per year in STEM education statewide.

Committee Discussion

In response to a committee member's question on ways to retain STEM students, Ms. O'Geary suggested bringing in fresh energy and having students work on real-world problems will support retention efforts. As an example, Dr. Trujillo highlighted NMSU, which uses a cohort model for engineering students in which they take all of their courses together and has an entrepreneurial space where students are free to collaborate. Ms. Balas also commented that retention-based programs such as the New Mexico Alliance for Minority Participation are working.

BUILDING THE WORKFORCE OF TOMORROW IN NEW MEXICO

The Chair recognized Mr. Scott Kennedy, Director, Strategic Alliances, and Ms. Tammara Edgin, Education Account Executive, Microsoft Corporation, to discuss building the workforce needs of tomorrow in New Mexico.

Referring to a committee handout, Mr. Kennedy noted the following observations by the US Bureau of Labor Statistics:

- more than 50 percent of today's jobs require some degree of technology skills, and experts say the percentage will increase to 77 percent by 2020;
- computer science is a top paying college degree and computer programming jobs are growing at twice the national average; and
- by 2020, there will be 1.0 million more information technology (IT) jobs than IT students.

He added that, in 2010, a Microsoft Certified Professional Satisfaction Survey of hiring managers found:

- 91 percent consider employee certification as a criterion for hiring; and
- 81 percent believe certified individuals perform better than noncertified peers.

While noting Microsoft skills are in demand, Mr. Kennedy highlighted a chart showing that there are 1,448 open Microsoft-related positions in a wide range of industries across New Mexico.

Ms. Edgin continued by informing the committee that according to a white paper sponsored by Microsoft, the top three most desired job skills are:

1. oral and written communication;
2. attention to detail; and
3. proficiency in Microsoft Office.

She added that 21st Century workers will need skills that enable them to collaborate, communicate, and be critical thinkers, innovators, problem solvers, and citizens of a global economy. According to Ms. Edgin, Microsoft trains students through its IT Academy, and enables its Certiport testing in the classroom to provide students with IT certifications that lead to job hires.

North Carolina was the first to conduct a statewide deployment of the training and certification program, and is about four years into its high school program, she said. Since then, over 200,000 certifications have been issued statewide. Microsoft Office Specialist and various "learn to code" offerings are the most popular certifications, according to Ms. Edgin. To conclude, she indicated that Microsoft IT Academy training can also be deployed for adults through workforce development centers.

Committee Discussion

Observing Microsoft's promotion of additional resources for public schools, a committee member asked what contributions were expected in return. In reply, Mr. Kennedy stated Microsoft has a pricing structure which is the same across the board, approximately \$1,500 for the training program and \$3,600 for the site license. He added that the training program can lead to increased grade point averages and decreased dropout rates when students see what an education can do for them in the future, commenting more success was seen rural areas.

DIRECTOR'S REPORT

a. Approval of September 2015 LESC Minutes

Ms. Frances Ramírez-Maestas, LESC staff, indicated a committee member had raised concerns about the description of the closed session held in September to discuss matters related to personnel and the motions to enter into it. Following consultation with Legislative Council Service staff, LESC staff drafted amended language to address those concerns; however, Ms. Ramírez-Maestas explained those revisions had not yet been incorporated into the version of the minutes in the meeting materials for committee members.

On a motion by Senator Sapien, seconded by Senator Brandt, the committee approved the minutes for the August 2015 interim meeting revised with the changes previously discussed.

b. Administrative Rulemaking

Mr. Kevin Force, LESC staff, provided an update on recent administrative rulemaking. Mr. Force indicated that there were two rulemakings, one by the Public Education Department (PED), and one by the New Mexico Public Schools Insurance Authority (NMPSIA).

The first rulemaking, published in the *New Mexico Register* on September 29, 2015 by PED, proposed to repeal and replace 6.12.4 NMAC, "Tobacco, Alcohol and Drug Free School Districts," expanding its provisions to include:

- a new, more inclusive title, "Tobacco, Alcohol and Drug Free Schools";
- an objective tailored to address a greater variety of potential abuses, such as student use of liquid nicotine and e-cigarettes;
- new and updated definitions, such as:
 - "e-cigarettes," which includes any device providing a vapor of nicotine, except any product regulated by the US Food and Drug Administration (FDA) under the *Federal Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act*;
 - "illicit drugs," which now includes prescription and over-the-counter medications used for non-medical purposes, or other than prescribed, including all supplemental dietary or nutritional performance enhancers;
 - "mood-altering substance," which includes stimulants, opioids, intoxicating inhalants, and hallucinogens; and
 - "nicotine liquid containers";
- requirements for local school boards and state-chartered charter school governing bodies to establish drug-free school policies that include:
 - specific prohibitions regarding the use of unpermitted substances;
 - enumeration of potential sanctions and disciplinary action; and
 - protection from civil liability for school personnel who report violations of the policy; and

- a specific exemption for students who lawfully possess a tobacco-cessation product that has been approved by the FDA.

A committee member asked Mr. Joe Guillen, Executive Director, New Mexico School Boards Association, whether schools would be prepared to implement the policies required by the new rulemaking. Mr. Force noted the rule was only in the proposed stage and no new regulatory action was yet required by school districts or schools.

Mr. Force continued, noting the second rulemaking, from NMPSIA, was adopted on September 29, 2015, and included several relatively simple amendments:

- 6.50.1.9 NMAC was amended to allow the NMPSIA Board of Directors to name an ex-board member to serve on the permanent risk advisory and permanent employee benefits committees as a voting member, for a term of three years, with the possibility of renewal for an additional three years;
- 6.50.10.10 NMAC was amended to permit 61 days, rather than the 31 days currently permitted, for members and potential members to submit the following supporting documentation for coverage to the authority:
 - an infant's birth certificate, if unavailable at the time of enrollment for non-medical dependant benefits, if submitted within 61 days from the first day of the month following the newborn dependant's birth;
 - supportive documentation for an adoptive placement may be submitted for newly adopted dependents within 61 days of the placement date; and
 - documentation required with the application for coverage, including any necessary evidence of insurability, may be submitted by the person seeking coverage within 61 days of the qualifying event.

c. Informational Items

Ms. Ramírez-Maestas reported that for the committee's review, the following items were included in the meeting materials for committee members:

- a report from the Higher Education Department on enrollment trends by age group and ethnic group in fulfillment of a request previously made by the committee;
- the written decision from the US Secretary of Education to affirm the initial decision of a federal administrative judge with respect to a preliminary hearing pertaining to New Mexico's maintenance of state financial support for special education under the federal *Individuals with Disabilities Education Act*;
- a report from the New Mexico Early Learning Advisory Council including its strategic plan and recommendations;
- materials obtained from the *Zuni Public School District, et. al. v. the State of New Mexico* status conference held on October 13, 2015; and
- the LESC Newsletter, October 2015, which Ms. Ramírez-Maestas reported was sent to all legislators and education stakeholders on the LESC email listing.

Additionally, Mr. Force addressed a committee request to investigate the substance of concerns raised during community input received at the September 2015 interim meeting of the LESC,

which called into question a perceived change in the administration of alternative licensure requirements by PED.

The applicable provisions in law, Mr. Force explained, had been amended by two different bills during the same legislative session; however, the separate provisions had not been reconciled, and as a result, only one set of provisions had been compiled, with the other provisions still having the force of law but appearing only in the annotations. Mr. Force characterized PED's actions as not being incongruent with either set of provisions; however, he also posited that, although not statutorily required, PED could provide more transparency to individuals pursuing alternative licensure by promulgating rules clearly addressing this perceived ambiguity.

THE COLLEGE BOARD: ADVANCED PLACEMENT IN NEW MEXICO

The Chair recognized Dr. Michelle Cruz Arnold, Senior Director, Government Relations, The College Board. Dr. Cruz Arnold began by stating The College Board helps more than 7.0 million students prepare for successful transition to college through programs and services – including the PSAT/NMSQT, SAT, and Advanced Placement® (AP) each year.

Founded in 1900, she noted the College Board is a mission-driven, not-for-profit organization that connects students to success and opportunity with a membership that includes over 6,000 of the world's leading educational institutions. Since 1955, the AP program has enabled millions of students to take college-level courses and exams, and to earn college credit or placement while in high school and today, more than 18,000 schools worldwide participate in the AP program, according to Dr. Cruz Arnold.

The College Board seeks to:

- ensure that every student in the United States has access to a high-quality education and is prepared to succeed in college;
- promote curricula, assessment tools, district and guidance resources that help K-12 students prepare for the academic rigors of higher education through college-readiness initiatives; and
- assist high school students to earn college credit and advanced placement, and learn from some of the most skilled, dedicated, and inspiring teachers in the world through AP college-level courses and exams.

Dr. Cruz Arnold explained AP is a collaboration between motivated students, secondary schools, and colleges and universities. The AP program offers 37 courses nationally and will add Computer Science Principals in 2016.

Of the 2.5 million students who took 4.5 million exams nationwide in 2015, Dr. Cruz Arnold stated 26.2 percent of exam takers were underrepresented students, 22.1 percent were low-income students, and 60.5 percent, or 1.5 million students, scored 3 or higher on an AP exam.

In comparison, of the 8,609 New Mexico students who took 13,807 exams in 2015, Dr. Cruz Arnold stated 54 percent of AP exam takers were underrepresented students, 35.2 percent were low-income students, and 40.5 percent, or 3,488 students, scored 3 or higher on an AP exam.

She explained that, in 2013 a partnership between New Mexico and the College Board began with a goal to increase access to rigorous secondary school coursework focused on college- and career-readiness based on opportunities to increase college-readiness and reduce college cost. The scope of work was to:

- increase AP access and success with a focus on Hispanic and American Indian students;
- provide the PSAT/NMSQT to all tenth grade students as an important step on the college- and career-readiness pathway; and
- expand rigor and readiness for pre-AP and AP teachers through professional development and support.

Dr. Cruz Arnold noted, in 2014-2015 New Mexico families saved over \$3.0 million through successful scores on AP exams. Nationally more than 5,800 college faculty members participate in AP on an annual basis. Among other reasons, the program is growing, because:

- AP students succeed in college;
- AP provides opportunities for underrepresented students to succeed; and
- AP credit opportunities attract motivate and prepared students.

The College Board annually relies on faculty participation to ensure that AP continually evolves to keep pace with changes in academic disciplines and best practices in college-level learning. These faculty members participated in:

- AP course and exam development;
- AP exam scoring and score setting;
- AP course syllabi review; and
- professional development for AP teachers.

In 2013, a total of 83 New Mexico educators were faculty participants, including:

- 60 AP high school teachers;
- 23 college and university faculty members;
- 14 AP professional development leaders; and
- three AP development committee members.

Dr. Cruz Arnold stated strong AP programs in high school, coupled with data-driven policies in colleges and universities support many positive outcomes for students. Multiple research studies have confirmed that AP students who achieve scores of 3 or higher on AP exams:

- perform well in subsequent college courses in the discipline;
- are more likely to major in their AP subject or a related discipline, particularly in the science, technology, engineering, and mathematics subjects;
- take more –not less – college coursework in the discipline;
- are more likely to graduate within four years; and
- have opportunities to succeed.

Dr. Cruz Arnold said that, based on a study by *Morgan, R., & Klaric, J. (2007)*, students who earned a 3 or higher on an AP exam in most subjects performed the same as or better than

non-AP students in the sequent college course related to their AP Exam – even after controlling for prior academic achievement.

In closing, Dr. Cruz Arnold told the committee that a clear and consistent AP credit and placement policy can:

- ensure prospective students and families know which institutions recognize AP achievement and award course equivalent college credit and advanced placement based on qualifying scores;
- allow for the optimal application of qualifying AP scores for credit toward meeting general education requirements;
- improve seamless course articulation and transfer, credit portability, and degree completion rates; and
- reduce the duplication and accumulation of excess credit hours, minimizing economic burdens for students and families, and improve enrollment efficiency for higher education systems.

Committee Discussion

Sharing his experience as an AP teacher, a committee member asked whether teachers receive guidance on teaching college-level AP courses to younger high school students. Dr. Cruz Arnold noted The College Board does not typically recommend that high school freshmen take AP courses for several reasons, including the maturity of those students and the potential for lapses in the reinforcement of content learned in the course.

A committee member asked how AP courses are funded in New Mexico. Dr. Cruz Arnold replied that money flows through the funding formula so that school districts can decide whether or not to dedicate funding for an AP program.

CHILDREN, YOUTH AND FAMILIES DEPARTMENT EFFORTS TO PRODUCE POSITIVE OUTCOMES FOR FOSTER CHILDREN

The Chair recognized Mr. Jared Rounsville, Director, Protective Services Division, Children, Youth and Families Department (CYFD), to review the department's efforts to increase positive educational outcomes for foster children in New Mexico. Mr. Rounsville briefly outlined some of the department's efforts in this area.

First, Mr. Rounsville discussed the department's direct collaboration with schools, noting CYFD employs investigations caseworkers in Bernalillo and Santa Fe counties, for example, assigned to each school in the community to liaise with them and help them resolve matters related to child safety and data-sharing. Further, Mr. Rounsville noted a special liaison, responsible for ensuring that each such child has the resources that they need to succeed in their education, is assigned to each foster child in Hobbs.

Mr. Rounsville then indicated the Public Education Department (PED) is sponsoring a "Safe Schools Summit" in partnership with CYFD, to share information on school and child safety, and collaborate on measures to help ensure foster children move through the educational system smoothly and safely.

Continuing, Mr. Rounsville reminded the committee members of legislation enacted in 2014 that provided a postsecondary tuition waiver program for youth who are aging out of the foster care system. Any institution of higher education in New Mexico can offer this program to any child who is either aging out of foster care or who was adopted after age 16.

CYFD also administers the federal Education and Training Vouchers program that helps youth who are aging out of foster care or who were adopted after age 16 by making available up to \$5,000 per year to help defray educational and vocational training costs. In order to receive these vouchers, which may be used for educational costs beyond tuition and fees, eligible youth must have graduated high school or achieved their high school equivalency credential.

Through Central New Mexico Community College, CYFD also has a postsecondary educational advocacy pilot project that has been administrated successfully in other states. An offsite coordinator works with former foster students enrolled in the college to help them navigate campus life and find educational success. The program also provides quarterly training to institution staff in the areas of admissions, financial aid, and student services to help these administrators better understand the unique needs and difficulties of former foster youth.

Mr. Rounsville noted a 2015 data-sharing agreement between PED and CYFD provides for consistent and accurate reporting on foster youth issues such as school changes, graduation rates, student discipline, special education, and retention, and links Student Teacher Accountability Reporting System information with CYFD data. Further, CYFD hopes to execute a similar memorandum of understanding with the Higher Education Department to track tuition waivers, utilization of education and training vouchers, and levels of success for youth formerly in the foster care system.

Committee Discussion

One committee member inquired about the ratio of educational liaisons to students, wondering if the state had the necessary resources for such a program, while acknowledging that it was a very good idea. Mr. Rounsville responded he did not have any figures on liaison to student ratios for the program but would provide them to the staff at a later time. However, Mr. Rounsville also noted the program is, at least currently, funded by private dollars and run by FosterEd, a private nonprofit organization, and is being tracked to see if its results are commensurate with results of similar programs in other states.

This member then asked whether the voucher program was applicable to youth fostered out of state, but returning to New Mexico to continue their education. Mr. Rounsville replied that this was a federal program, and that all foster youth were eligible, regardless of where they might have been fostered. The tuition waiver program, on the other hand, was only open to youth who age out of the foster system, or were adopted after age 16, in New Mexico.

Another member inquired as to whether youth who are moving out of the juvenile justice system were eligible for these programs. Mr. Rounsville noted that they were not, although youth who were simultaneously aging out of the foster and juvenile justice systems would be eligible.

SUPERINTENDENT AND COMMUNITY INPUT

The Chair recognized Ms. Sonya Berg, State Policy Co-Chair for the American Association of University Women (AAUW). Ms. Berg began by explaining the role of AAUW in advocating for women on key issues. Citing AAUW research on the representation of women in the science, technology, engineering, and mathematics fields, Ms. Berg suggested representation has been increasing and highlighted that more than half of biology graduates are now women. However, Ms. Berg also noted little progress being made in the fields of engineering and computer science. In conclusion, Ms. Berg reiterated the sentiment from an earlier presentation that Advanced Placement courses can make a difference in the lives of young students by providing exposure to fields in which there might be an underrepresentation of women or other demographic groups.

The Chair recognized Mr. Tom Sullivan, Superintendent, Moriarty-Edgewood School District. Drawing on his personal experiences in education and the successes of the school district he currently serves, Mr. Sullivan challenged the members of the committee to find educators in their communities who are respected, solicit the advice of those educators on the state of education facing them, and help to create a positive educational environment.

There being no further business, the Chair with the consensus of the committee, recessed the LESC meeting at 4:09 p.m.

**MINUTES
LESC MEETING
October 30, 2015**

Representative Dennis J. Roch, Chair, called the meeting of the Legislative Education Study Committee (LESC) to order at 8:16 a.m., on Friday, October 30, 2015, in Room 307 of the State Capitol in Santa Fe, New Mexico.

The following voting members of the LES C were present:

Representatives Dennis J. Roch, Chair, Nora Espinoza, Tomás E. Salazar, Sheryl M. Williams Stapleton, Christine Trujillo, and Monica Youngblood; and Senators John M. Sapien, Vice Chair, Craig W. Brandt, and Howie C. Morales.

The following voting member of the LES C was not present:

Senator Gay G. Kernan.

The following advisory members of the LES C were present:

Representatives Alonzo Baldonado, G. Andrés Romero, and Patricia Roybal Caballero; and Senators Lee S. Cotter, John Pinto, William P. Soules, and Mimi Stewart.

The following advisory members of the LES C were not present:

Representatives Jim Dines, David M. Gallegos, Stephanie Garcia Richard, Jimmie C. Hall, D. Wonda Johnson, Timothy D. Lewis, James E. Smith, and James G. Townsend; and Senators Jacob R. Candelaria, Carlos R. Cisneros, Daniel A. Ivey-Soto, Linda M. Lopez, Michael Padilla, and Pat Woods.

NEW MEXICO ASSESSMENT INVENTORY: STATEWIDE RESULTS

The Chair recognized Ms. Leighann Lenti, Deputy Secretary, Policy and Programs, Public Education Department (PED), to inform the committee of the statewide results for the New Mexico Assessment Inventory (NMAI) that was required by the *General Appropriation Act of 2015 (GAA of 2015)*.

Quoting a White House Fact Sheet released on October 19, 2015 relating to student testing actions, Ms. Lenti explained New Mexico has decreased overall state-mandated testing time across all grades by an average of 30 minutes per year since 2010. She continued by adding that the state accomplished this by:

- implementing assessments aligned with more rigorous standards which led to less than 2.0 percent of the school year dedicated to state-mandated assessments;
- partnering with school districts to examine local assessment practices; and
- reducing duplicative testing.

Specific to Partnership for Assessment of Readiness for College and Careers (PARCC), Ms. Lenti stated, on average, New Mexico students will see a further reduction in testing time by 90 minutes per grade in FY 16.

Referring to a handout, Ms. Lenti stated the NMAI was due to PED on September 11, 2105; school districts and charter schools had five and half weeks to complete the NMAI Workbook. The NMAI was designed to:

- assist school districts and charter schools in obtaining a comprehensive picture of assessment practices currently used; and
- be utilized by PED to support school districts and charter schools in effective implementation of assessment best practices for teaching and learning.

Ms. Lenti indicated that the results of the NMAI can be categorized into three components:

1. aligned and actionable practices, including;
 - what assessments school districts are using;
 - results of the data and their use clearly articulated to PED; and
 - that assessments are fully aligned with assessment requirements outlined in statute;
2. evidence of “over testing,” including indication of duplicative assessment efforts; and
3. areas of needed clarification, including indication of assessments required by the federal or state that are not actually required by those entities.

Referring to a handout, Ms. Lenti noted 75 NMAI submissions, including 56 from school districts, indicated duplication in at least one assessment or subject area. Ms. Lenti explained further evidence of over-testing submitted to PED included:

- Elida Municipal Schools uses two interim assessments for third grade reading – Dynamic Indicators of Basic Early Literacy Skills (DIBELS Next) and Discovery Assessment;
- Rio Rancho Public Schools uses two interim assessments in kindergarten through third grade – DIBELS Next and Northwest Evaluation Association™ (NWEA) Measures of Academic Progress® (MAP) assessment;
- Artesia Public Schools uses three interim assessments in first grade – DIBELS Next, STAR Reading, and Discover Assessment;
- Alamogordo Public Schools uses two interim assessments in math for first through third grade;
- Chama Valley Independent Schools uses two English language arts interim assessments for third through eleventh grade and two math interim assessments for kindergarten through fifth grade; and
- Coral Community Charter School uses two interim assessments for kindergarten through third grade in reading – DIBELS Next and NWEA MAP.

Ms. Lenti noted that, the inventory doesn’t explain why districts have maintained the use of additional assessments like Discovery Assessment or NWEA MAP in grades K-3 when the state pays for DIBELS Next for all school districts and charter schools that participate in New Mexico

Reads to Lead!. She further noted, this is an area where school districts and charter schools can save money and eliminate extra time spent on duplicative assessments.

Ms. Lenti noted some school districts were confused about who required certain assessments. Some examples of misconception include:

- Bernalillo Public Schools indicated PED required the Discovery Assessment in fourth through eighth grade;
- Peñasco Independent Schools indicated both federal and state requirements for administering the SAT in eleventh grade;
- Las Cruces Public Schools indicated, for their master's program, PED required PSAT and Compass; and
- Albuquerque Public Schools submitted an inventory that appeared to be aligned with best practices but not with the assessment program provided on its website.

As for the next step, Ms. Lenti explained PED plans to:

- email each school district and charter school outlining bright spots in their inventory as well as include areas where additional conversations need to take place;
- provide clarification statewide for areas of consistent confusion of assessment requirements; and
- prepare these materials immediately so PED can share this information with all school districts and charter schools to continue the conversation of testing best practices.

Committee Discussion

When asked about assessments associated with New Mexico Reads to Lead!, Ms. Lenti noted many districts participating in the program, which requires the use of DIBELS Next, also use other assessment tools for reading in the early grades. She further noted interim assessments can be a great tool if the data are used to drive learning and instruction. However, she noted schools should not administer more than one assessment per subject, per grade-level. She explained that, while Los Lunas does not participate in New Mexico Reads to Lead! and has chosen a different assessment, the school district is still required by statute to screen and monitor progress in kindergarten through third grade.

Ms. Lenti explained that school districts using assessments other than DIBELS Next as part of the student achievement measure in the teacher and school leader evaluation system indicated so on the NMAI. She further noted that evaluators were trained to delineate between those districts using these assessments as part of their evaluation plan and those districts that were duplicating assessment efforts.

In response to a committee member's concern that, the NMAI didn't capture data regarding the amount of time that assessments interrupt instruction, Ms. Lenti explained that, although this information would be useful, language in the *GAA of 2015* did not specifically require the inventory to include those data.

Regarding the requirements for end-of-course (EoC) exams, Ms. Lenti stated all high school students have been required to take a final exam for a credit-bearing course since 1986. She

noted some districts choose to administer both an EoC and a final exam while others choose to only administer an EoC to fulfill the statutory requirement.

Regarding the possible elimination for the requirement to administer an interim assessment for college- and workforce-readiness in ninth and tenth grades, Ms. Lenti explained that PED would be interested in engaging in that conversation as we prepare for the upcoming 2016 legislative session.

In response to a member's concern regarding misconceptions of assessment requirements, Ms. Lenti explained that, after analyzing the inventory data, it was clear that PED needed to improve communication about testing requirements with school district and charter school leaders. She stated the Secretary of Public Education would like to have more collaborative conversations with superintendents about testing practices and equip districts and charter schools with clear information about federal and state testing requirements. In addition to offering a copy of the completed statewide NMAI to the LESC, Ms. Lenti explained that direct communications with school districts and charter schools pertaining to the NMAI will be available on the PED website within the next few weeks. As recommended by a committee member, the Chair also suggested the next LESC Newsletter feature the NMAI results to assist PED in communicating this information.

DEBIT CARDS FOR TEACHER SUPPLIES

The Chair recognized Mr. Paul Aguilar, Deputy Secretary, Finance and Operations, Public Education Department (PED), to report on the implementation of the teacher supply program. Citing consistent requests made by teachers to provide more support for classroom materials, Mr. Aguilar explained the *General Appropriation Act of 2015* appropriated \$2.0 million, based on the Governor's budget request, to provide prepaid debit cards to all teachers to purchase classroom supplies.

Mr. Aguilar indicated PED used the full-time equivalent employment of teachers reported in operating budgets to establish the allocation of \$100 debit cards to each school district and charter school, resulting in over- and under-allocation in some cases. All debit cards allocated by PED were to be distributed by school districts and charter schools by September 18, 2015, except for Albuquerque Public Schools and Las Cruces Public Schools, which received an extension through the end of October. Each issued debit card will expire on January 31, 2016, and remaining balances will revert to the state.

Emphasizing the importance of proper accounting for public money, Mr. Aguilar explained expenditures at movie theaters, liquor stores, automatic teller machines, and certain online retailers were automatically disallowed. In addition to these precautions, PED will conduct desk audits of 5.0 percent of all debit cards used.

Speaking to the implementation challenges of a new program, Mr. Aguilar said PED needs to provide nontaxable transaction certificate information to teachers sooner in future years to prevent tax being paid on tax-exempt purchases. Mr. Aguilar also noted PED could provide a list of approved vendors to program coordinators in the future.

Committee Discussion

In response to questions on the vendor selection process, Mr. Aguilar noted administrative cost was limited to \$50,000, or 2.5 percent of the total appropriation, and therefore did not require a request for proposal. Mr. Aguilar noted, aside from the relatively low cost, one of the reasons for selecting Blackhawk Engagement Solutions as the vendor was because they allow for the reversion of unspent funds to the state after the debit cards expire.

Hearing of pressure on teachers by outside groups to return debit cards, a committee member asked whether returned cards can be redistributed to other teachers who needed more money for supplies. Mr. Aguilar replied only 500, or 2.0 percent, of the 23,000 distributed debit cards had been returned, and he thought redistribution of remaining funds was allowable. Mr. Aguilar also noted a number of teachers are exploring the collaborative use of multiple debit cards to maximize purchasing power.

Comments from several committee members suggested the problem addressed by the debit cards exists because inadequate funding has been provided to school districts and charter schools for classroom materials.

COLLEGE OF EDUCATION REPORT CARDS

The Chair recognized Dr. Penny A. Garcia, Dean, College of Education and Technology, Eastern New Mexico University; Ms. Catron Allred, Director, Education Programs, Central New Mexico Community College; and Mr. Matt Pahl, Director of Policy, Public Education Department (PED), to update the committee on the progress made by PED and teacher preparation programs on report cards for the colleges of education.

Mr. Pahl began by informing the committee of the importance of teacher preparation programs. He highlighted that every student deserves a well-prepared, effective teacher. The research shows well-prepared teachers serve students better and are more likely to stay in the profession longer. Beginning teachers also serve at-risk students at a higher proportion than more experienced teachers. Accordingly, this emphasizes the importance of making teacher preparation programs meaningful and making sure educators are able to meet the needs of the students they are serving.

Providing background on the current direction in the country, Mr. Pahl noted that in September 2011, the US Department of Education (USDE) published *Our Future, Our Teachers*. This publication proposed a vision for improving teacher preparation in the United States as well as a report card. There were three types of measures to be included in a report card:

1. aggregate learning outcome data of public school students taught by graduates, using student achievement data;
2. job placements and retention rates of graduates, particularly in hard-to-staff areas; and
3. perception data from graduates of the program and principals of graduates.

Additionally, USDE released a proposed rule on teacher preparation report cards in November 2014. The proposed rule emphasized using data from teacher preparation programs to

differentiate programs based on student outcomes. He noted USDE has yet to issue a final rule on the matter.

Mr. Pahl noted PED believes it is important to set clear expectations for performance of teacher preparation programs and their graduates. PED also wants more accessible information on teacher preparation program performance, and this information is intended for the public, employers, and institutions of higher education (IHEs). In the future, the report card will act as the Educator Accountability Reporting System (EARS). The first report card will focus on student achievement, retention, and demographics. Subsequent versions of the report card will incorporate all the statutorily required data for the EARS report.

PED initially brought the idea to the deans and directors of teacher preparation programs in April 2014. Data-sharing agreements were signed this past summer with all the teacher preparation programs. The report card will distinguish between candidates who obtain a teaching license through traditional means or an alternative route.

Mr. Pahl stated that, the IHEs will leverage analysis of data previously not available to them, such as student achievement data, classroom performance evaluation information, and the National Evaluation Series™ test passage rates. IHEs will also receive information on where their teachers are placed as well as retention rates of those teachers. Mr. Pahl said PED will use the report as a component of teacher preparation program approval as well as future policy proposals and discussion.

Lastly, Mr. Pahl noted the next steps for the report card included continuing to work in collaboration with teacher preparation programs on publishing the report, data verification, metrics finalization, preview of final ratings, and execution of final ratings.

Dr. Garcia began by informing the committee that the deans and directors of the teacher preparation programs were proactive and sent Ms. Hanna Skandera, Secretary of Public Education, a letter emphasizing the importance to move forward on a data-sharing agreement. The agreement was signed after many months of collaboration. The data-sharing agreement enabled PED to receive the following information from teacher preparation programs: high school grade point average (GPA), undergraduate GPA, post-undergraduate GPA, ACT scores, student teaching district, alternative internship year school, program area, graduation date, and certificate granted. PED shared the following data with teacher preparation programs: summative New Mexico Teacher Evaluation Advisory Council (NMTEACH) performance data in the classroom for recent graduates, job placement data, years identified in service in New Mexico schools and districts, and aggregate public school student performance data as relevant per teacher.

Dr. Garcia noted the deans and directors of the teacher preparation programs appreciate information that will be reported based on whether the candidate received their degree through an undergraduate, graduate, or alternative licensure program. Other vital information now accessible through the data-sharing agreement include: where each program's graduates will be teaching, how many years they are being retained in the field, summative evaluation scores, and how well the students being taught by the graduates are performing.

Dr. Garcia detailed the following continuing concerns for teacher preparation programs: (1) time for response to preliminary data findings, which is time-consuming for the IHEs; (2) ability to

view the final version of the public and institutional report before publication; (3) how the programs will be rated, calculated, and possible consequences based on the rating; (4) which specific metrics were used to develop this model of program evaluation; and (5) how the teacher education report card will interface with the EARS report. Also, teacher preparation programs are required by statute to follow the entry-level teacher competencies. This is an extended list that is out of date. Dr. Garcia sent a request to PED to move away from the entry-level teacher competencies and begin to use the NMTEACH standards.

Another concern noted by Ms. Allred is that teacher retention will be highlighted in this report; however, the report does not reflect the school district's role in that outcome, specifically highlighting the importance of beginning teacher mentorship programs for which school districts and charter schools are responsible.

Committee Discussion

In reference to a committee member's inquiry on potential explanations for teachers moving out of state, Dr. Garcia noted that other states might offer a higher quality of living, New Mexico is limited in what it can pay beginning teachers, the teacher evaluation systems are different in other states, and New Mexico is limited in the type of specialized degrees it can offer teacher candidates.

A committee member noted there may be a high number of graduates who leave New Mexico to teach out of state. However, Mr. Pahl stated that based on the numbers provided to PED that 80 percent of the teacher candidate graduates stay in New Mexico and teach in the state.

SUPERINTENDENT AND COMMUNITY INPUT

The Chair recognized Ms. Ellen Bernstein, President, Albuquerque Teachers Federation, for comments regarding student assessment and debit cards issued to teachers for the purchase of school supplies. With respect to testing, Ms. Bernstein suggested high-stakes testing had led to the use of give pretests, posttests, and interim tests not mandated by law. Additionally, she cited concerns from teachers represented by her union that mandates from PED had placed an excessive emphasis on testing in K-3 Plus. With respect to debit cards to purchase school supplies, Ms. Bernstein refuted claims that her union had encouraged teachers to refuse the debit card. However, she emphasized the union's stance that debit cards to teachers should not be used in lieu of adequate funding to schools.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the Chair adjourned the LESC meeting at 12:31 p.m.